

Goals and Learning Objectives

- 1) Familiarize yourself with major species concepts (e.g., BSC, PSC) and the advantages or challenges in applying these to taxa
- 2) Understand how patterns of character displacement can arise, and relate this to cases of reinforcement. How have these cases been used to demonstrate the process of speciation?
- 3) Be able to identify and distinguish the different geographic modes of speciation and the role (or conditions) of gene flow/isolation in each of these
- 4) Consider the conditions and evidence one needs to demonstrate the geographic context of speciation and its modes (allopatric, peripatric, parapatric, sympatric)

"Wallace and Darwin's great insight [natural selection as a factor in speciation] only began the era of asking. The 'mystery of mysteries' had been solved, at least in rough outline; then came the task of elaboration.

The colleagues and successors of Darwin and Wallace have now been at it for more than a century and a quarter, and throughout most of that effort biogeography has been their paramount tool.

The patterns of species distribution have provided clues about the ways in which species originate, change, and diverge, and the question how? has remained inseparable from the question where?....

The linkage between geographical circumstance and evolutionary development is embodied in the very word 'biogeography'."





ISLAND BIOGEOGRAPHY IN AN AGE OF EXTINCTION DAVID QUAMMEN "Stunning."—BARRY LOPEZ, AUTHOR OF <u>ARCTIC DREAMS</u>

"Wallace and Darwin's great insight [natural selection as a factor in speciation] only began the era of asking. The 'mystery of mysteries' had been solved, at least in rough outline; then came the task of elaboration.

The colleagues and successors of Darwin and Wallace have now been at it for more than a century and a quarter, and throughout most of that effort biogeography has been their paramount tool.

The patterns of species distribution have provided clues about the ways in which species originate, change, and diverge, and the question how? has remained inseparable from the question where?....

The linkage between geographical circumstance and evolutionary development is embodied in the very word 'biogeography'."







"The man who knew islands"

Alfred R. Wallace (1823-1913)

More than any other, Wallace compiled observations on distributions, diversity, extinction, disjunctions, and climate effects on distribution into a series of major works all between 1869 and 1880: "The Malay Archipelago", "The Geographical Distribution of Animals", and "Island Life"



"The man who knew islands"

Alfred R. Wallace (1823-1913)

Famous for recognizing *Wallace's Line* which separates fauna of southeast Asian origin from those of Australian origin

ORIENTAL REGION From Alfred Russel Wallace Scale 1 inch-1000 mile The Geographic Distribution of Animals, 1876 EXPLANATION rventrial Con n Sea level to 1000 fee Talam.d. L000 Feet to 2,500 5/104 guato Reeling Is



mage credit: http://people.wku.edu/ charles.smith/wallace/altphoto.htm

"The man who knew islands"

Alfred R. Wallace (1823-1913)





Image credit: http://people.wku.edu, charles.smith/wallace/altphoto.htm

Why study species and speciation?

What constitutes a "species" and how they arise (speciation) is fundamental to biogeography:

1) Recall that the geographic distribution of species (and their attributes) is the fundamental unit of observation in biogeography. To collect and understand data on distributions, we must define what we mean by species.

2) The role of geography in speciation is still controversial and geographic aspects of species formation remain important areas of investigation.

3) The geographic distributions of species have played and continue to play important roles in understanding the process of speciation.

Overview of this section:

- 1) Challenges to defining species
- 2) A note on species concepts
- 2) Mechanisms of speciation
- 3) Geography of speciation

Overview of this section:

- 1) Challenges to defining species
- 2) A note on species concepts
- 2) Mechanisms of speciation
- 3) Geography of speciation

How distinct must a group of individuals be to be declared a species?

Some species have a tremendous amount of morphological and/or genetic diversity across their range.

Sometimes groups of individuals are identical morphologically, but genetically differentiated (cryptic species).

Morphological differentiation of the yarrow (*Achillea millefolium*) along an elevational gradient in the Sierra Nevada mountains of California



Lomolino *et al.* 2010¹²

Demonstrated through common garden experiments that variation was result of adaptive (genetic) differentiation of a single population



Lomolino *et al.* 2010¹³

These differences reflect local adaptation, due to a combination of strong natural selection and limited gene flow.



Lomolino *et al.* 2010¹⁴

Cryptic speciation in *Troglodytes* wrens, Tumbler Ridge (TR), Central BC



Toews and Irwin, Molecular Ecology, 2008_5

Cryptic speciation in *Troglodytes* wrens, Tumbler Ridge, Central BC



Toews and Irwin, Molecular Ecology, 2008_6

Overview of this section:

- 1) Challenges to defining species
- 2) A note on species concepts
- 3) Mechanisms of Speciation
- 4) Geography of Speciation

We won't cover alternative species concepts in detail...

There are at least 25 species concepts, concisely described by four groups (Coyne & Orr 2004)

- 1) Biological Species Concept (BSC)
- 2) Phylogenetic Species Concepts (PSC)
- 3) [Genotypic or Phenotypic] Cohesion Species Concepts (CSC)
- 4) Ecological or Evolutionary Species Concepts (EcSC, EvSC)

Variation in most traits among individuals is **discontinuous**

Some individuals are very similar to one another, but differ greatly from other clumps of individuals – "clumpy-gappy" organization of biological diversity

Species concepts differ greatly in the sorts of clumps or groups they recognize...



Character displacement in Darwin's finches

Morphology of species is influenced by co-occurring species and resource use

Discontinuous variation represents what most species concepts try to capture...

Lomolino *et al.* 2010¹⁹

Biological Species Concept: species are groups of interbreeding natural populations that are reproductively isolated from other groups (Mayr 1942, 1995). Most widely held concept for species delineation.



with time, reproductive isolation...

Biological Species Concept: species are groups of interbreeding natural populations that are reproductively isolated from other groups (Mayr 1942, 1995). Most widely held concept for species delineation.

Issues:

How important is the distinction between *actually* or *potentially* interbreeding?

How can we apply the BSC to geographically isolated populations? How can we apply the BSC to species known only from fossils? How do we consider asexual species?



Phylogenetic Species Concept: a phylogenetic species is (1) a monophyletic lineage, (2) derived through an evolutionary process of descent from an ancestral lineage and (3) diagnosable through examination of character state transformations (McKitrick & Zink 1988; Cracraft 1989).

Issues:

Which derived diagnostic character states do we focus on?

Requires reliable knowledge of evolutionary relationships of species.

Benefits:

Can apply to asexual and sexual reproducing species

Some terms in describing species relationships

Monophyletic group: Descendants from a single common ancestor Paraphyletic group: Does not include all descendants from single common ancestor Polyphyletic group: Descendants that have multiple origins, descended from more than one ancestor – an issue when species are described without genetic data



Overview of this section:

- 1) Challenges to defining species
- 2) A note on species concepts and terms
- 3) Mechanisms of Speciation
- 4) Geography of Speciation

What is Speciation?

Speciation: the splitting of a single ancestral species into two or more descendant species.



What is Speciation?

Speciation: the splitting of a single ancestral species into two or more descendant species.



Different species concepts disagree on where 2 species should be recognized.

- Morphological, mtDNA, multiple genes,
- reproductive isolation,
- ecological differentiation

We'll consider mechanisms that affect speciation as those that influence reproductive isolation.

Mechanisms of genetic differentiation:

- Mutation
- Genetic drift
- Natural selection
- Gene flow

And could also include:

- Physical isolation
- Sexual Selection
- Hybridization

The divergence of an ancestral species into two or more daughter species requires genetic changes among populations, ranging from those that are simply used to diagnose different species (e.g., under the PSC) to those that actually cause reproductive isolation between an ancestrally single reproductive community (e.g., under the BSC).

Mechanisms of genetic differentiation:

- Mutation
- Genetic drift
- Natural selection
- Gene flow

And could also include:

- Physical isolation
- Sexual Selection
- Hybridization

Selection vs. Drift in Speciation

(a very quick note)

Peak shift speciation

Natural selection pushes populations towards fitness peaks

Peak shifts are more likely with genetic drift, where small population size allows populations (by chance) to cross "fitness valleys"



An adaptive landscape which shows fitness peaks for allele frequencies, separated by adaptive valleys



"Dobzhansky-Muller Model"

As populations diverge, different alleles may become fixed in each by **natural selection** or (less likely) **genetic drift**

If those two populations meet again and interbreed, they could bring together alleles that are incompatible, and their offspring may have lower fitness.



Presgraves 2010



Sætre and Saether 2010

collared flycatcher (*Ficedula albicollis*)



Sætre and Saether 2010



Reinforcement

natural selection against maladaptive hybridization

Male pied and collared flycatchers from allopatric populations have similar black & white plumage

Where ranges of the species overlap, male pied flycatchers are dull brown (collared's have a larger white patch)

Plumage differences in sympatric males reduce hybridization...Females never make a mistake for the other species when males have the sympatric plumage pattern



Sætre et al. 1997







African Tinkerbirds:

Songs in sympatric populations differ more compared to songs in allopatric populations

Kirschel et al. 2009
Mechanisms that affect Speciation



Allopatric tinkerbirds respond significantly more than sympatric tinkerbirds to heterospecific playback.

Songs become more distinct in sympatric populations, which enables species recognition.

Kirschel et al. 2009

Mechanisms that affect Speciation

Character displacement can be symmetric or asymmetric in sympatry

When species 1 is common, but species 2 is rare, species 1 is not influenced by the rare presence of species 2 in sympatry



Allopatry Sympatry Allopatry

Allopatry Sympatry Allopatry

Kirschel et al. 2009

Models of speciation have traditionally been organized based on geography

- Allopatric speciation
 - Vicariant speciation
 - Peripatric speciation
- Parapatric speciation
- Sympatric speciation

The geography of speciation has been hotly debated:

Does speciation require complete geographic isolation, or can it occur in populations that exchange genes to a limited extent (parapatric) or freely (sympatric)?

Major modes of geographic speciation can be viewed along a continuum of gene flow



1. Allopatric Speciation – Vicariant speciation

The evolution of reproductive isolation during geographic isolation

Has long been recognized as a principle mechanism of speciation, but championed by Ernst Mayr (e.g., Mayr 1963).



1. Allopatric Speciation – Vicariant speciation

Vicariance: establishment of a barrier separating populations that were already present



Geographic separation of populations can occur through climatic or geological events (e.g., elevation of land bridges, glaciation, formation of mountains, continental drift)

1. Allopatric Speciation

Biogeographic observations:

1) Allopatry of sister species





Bonefishes occur in tropical sandflats across the globe Once classified as a single pantropical species, based on conserved morphological/ecological traits

1. Allopatric Speciation

Biogeographic observations:

1) Allopatry of sister species

Sister species and clades are allopatric

Most divisions attributed to geological and oceanographic boundaries (e.g., mid-Atlantic expanse, Sunda Shelf)



Phylogeny of Albula mtDNA haplotypes



1. Allopatric Speciation

Biogeographic observations:

2) Geographic concordance of species range boundaries (and hybrid zones)









1. Allopatric Speciation

Biogeographic observations:

3) The absence of sister species where isolation is unlikely



1. Allopatric Speciation

Biogeographic observations:

4) Increased reproductive isolation with increased geographic distance







Siberian populations of greenish warbler (YK and ST) are among the most divergent in plumage (i.e., wing bar width) and genetics, not shown, but similar in body size

(Irwin et al. 2001)

1. Allopatric Speciation

Biogeographic observations:

4) Increased reproductive isolation with increased geographic distance







PC1 - Increasing length of song, number of units and types Siberian populations of greenish warbler (TL and BK) are among the most divergent in songs (more complex), Himalayan populations have similar songs (simplest)

Geospiza fuli ginosa

Geospiza fortis

Some of the best examples of allopatric speciation are shown by radiation of species on island archipelagos...



(Lomolino *et al.* 2010)

Galapagos archipelago, with number of Darwin's Finch species breeding on each island, and a phylogeny of Darwin's Finches showing relation to mainland ancestor.



Pinta (9)

0

Santiago (10)

6

Rábida

(8) Pinzón

(10)

Floreana 🙆

(8)

Marchena (7)

Daphne Major (4)

⊖ Santa Fé

(7)

Santa Cruz (9)

Genovesa (4)

San Cristóbal

(7)

Española

(3)

^o Darwin (3)

Fernandina

(10)

Isabellá (10)

° Wolf (3)

Speciation cycle in Darwin's Finches comprises three steps:

- 1) Colonization of the archipelago
- 2) Establishment of allopatric populations
- 3) Establishment of sympatry



⁽Grant et al. 1996)

Geological history of the Galapagos archipelago over the last 3 Ma, since the time they were colonized by ancestral Darwin's Finches



The Galapagos islands are located on the northern part of the Nazca plate, which is slowly drifting over a volcanic hotspot towards the southeast (at 5cm/yr)

As the plate moves, the hotspot remains stationary, so islands are formed and slowly drift away, allowing the creation of new islands.

Geological history of the Galapagos archipelago over the last 3 Ma, since the time they were colonized by ancestral Darwin's Finches



Geological history of the Galapagos archipelago over the last 3 Ma, since the time they were colonized by ancestral Darwin's Finches



Geological history of the Galapagos archipelago over the last 3 Ma, since the time they were colonized by ancestral Darwin's Finches



Geological history of the Galapagos archipelago over the last 3 Ma, since the time they were colonized by ancestral Darwin's Finches



Accumulation of Darwin's Finch species in relation to the increase in number of Galapagos islands



Honeycreepers on the Hawaiian archipelago



For Darwin's finches and Hawaiian honeycreepers, ecological differentiation to exploit different niches (i.e., food resources) led to radiation



(Lomolino *et al.* 2010)

2. Peripatric Speciation – a special kind of allopatric speciation, usually due to "founder effect" and high genetic drift



...one difference between vicariant and peripatric speciation is that in the latter case, one population is very small and involves invasion of novel habitats that exert strong selection and/or high genetic drift

2. Peripatric Speciation



Cocos Finch (*Pinaroloxias inornata*)

Most closely related to clade of tree finches in Galapagos – a peripheral isolate related to Galapagos Darwin's finches



3. Parapatric Speciation – variable populations diverge along selective gradient



...in parapatric speciation, selection on opposite ends of a gradient must favor strong differentiation in the face of gene flow where ranges remain in contact

3. Parapatric Speciation

How do we know this is allopatric and not parapatric speciation?



3. Parapatric Speciation

How do we know this is allopatric and not parapatric speciation?

This possibility is unlikely since the ecotone did not exist over most of the period when the species diverged (the Pleistocene glacial cycles). But, the ecological transition may play a role in maintaining the hybrid zones



3. Parapatric Speciation (?)

Recall elevational replacements in congeners along mountainsides Ecological determinants of distribution are likely competition... But how did these patterns arise? Were they generated by parapatric speciation?



3. Parapatric Speciation (?)

Recall elevational replacements in congeners along mountainsides Ecological determinants of distribution are likely competition... But how did these patterns arise? Were they generated by parapatric speciation?



To demonstrate parapatric speciation we would have to answer the following:

- 1) Are the species sister taxa?
- 2) Is there divergence in phenotypic or signaling traits associated with elevation?
- 3) Is there reproductive isolation between forms replacing each other?
- 4) Is divergence in signals associated with assortative mating?



In some cases we can map different geological events onto a phylogeny, giving us inference of the timing of diversification with respect to historical events.

4. Sympatric Speciation



4. Sympatric Speciation

Criteria for concluding that speciation occurred in sympatry (from Coyne & Orr 2004):

- 1. Species must be largely or completely sympatric
- 2. The species must have substantial (genetically-based) reproductive isolation
- 3. The sympatric species must be sister species
- 4. The biogeographic history of the species must make an allopatric phase very unlikely

4. Sympatric Speciation

Cases of sympatric speciation?

- Darwin's Finches
- Hawaiian Honeycreepers
- Cichlid fish in African lakes
- African Indigobirds

Note: Sympatric speciation is easiest when one trait has multiple functions...

4. Sympatric Speciation – cichlid fishes in Africa. Here, distribution and phylogeny combine to suggest sympatric speciation



AFRICA	
Lake Victoria —	a st
Lake Tanganyika —	
Lake Malawi 🛛 —	
	マリア

Lake	Area (km²)	Endemic cichlid species	Maximum age of lake	Major fish lineage
Victoria	68 635	~ 500	0.75 myr	Haplochromine
Malawi	29 604	659-1000	2 myr	Haplochromine
Tanganyika	32 893	170-250	12 myr	Several
Nabugabo	29	5	0.004 myr	Haplochromine
Barombi Mbo	4	11	1 myr	Tilapiine
Bermin	0.6	9	2.5 myr	Tilapiine
4. Sympatric Speciation

Lake Malawi was invaded by a riverine generalist ~700 000 years ago

Common ancestor subsequently diverged into sand-dwelling and rock-dwelling lineages



(Lomolino *et al.* 2010)

4. Sympatric Speciation

Rock-dwelling lineage diverged into ~12 genera distinguished primarily on trophic morphology, suggesting the importance of trophic competition during radiation

Subsequently, ~25 species per genus diverged presumably in response to sexual selection via female choice for male colour pattern.





(Lomolino et al. 2010)

4. Sympatric Speciation

Selection fixed opsin proteins with different light absorbance properties

Divergent visual system coincides with divergent male breeding coloration

Divergent natural selection acting on ecological traits, which also affect mate choice



4. Sympatric Speciation

Indigobirds (*Vidua sp.*) Host-specific brood parasites

Male indigobirds mimic host songs

Females use these songs to choose both their mates and the nests they parasitize

Host specificity provides mechanism for reproductive isolation after a new host is colonized

(Host switches lead to speciation because both males and females imprint on their hosts)



Sorensen et al. 2003

Remember: We can view modes of speciation along a continuum of how much genes are exchanged between diverging populations



Geographic Modes of Speciation

Speciation

References for this section:

- Burns, K.J., S.J. Hackett, & N.K. Klein. 2002. Phylogenetic relationships and morphological diversity in Darwin's Finches and their relatives. *Evolution* 56: 1240-1252.
- Colborn, J., *et al.* 2001. The evolutionary enigma of bonefishes (*Albula* spp.): cryptic species and ancient separations in a globally distributed shorefish. *Evolution* 55: 807-820.
- Coyne, J.A., & H.A. Orr. 2004. Speciation. Sinauer Associates Inc., Sunderland, Massachusetts.
- Coyne, J.A., & T.D. Price. 2000. Little evidence for sympatric speciation in island birds. *Evolution* 54: 2166-2171.
- Cracraft, J. 1989. Speciation and its ontology: the empirical consequences of alternative species concepts for understanding patterns and processes of differentiation. In: Otte, D. & Endler, J.A. (eds.) Speciation and its consequences. Sunderland, Massachusetts; Sinauer Associates, Inc.: 28-59.
- Danley, P.D., & T.D. Kocher. 2001. Speciation in rapidly diverging systems: lessons from Lake Malawi. *Molecular Ecology* 10: 1075–1086.
- Dawley, R.M., and J.P. Bogart, eds. 1989. *Evolution and Ecology of Unisexual Vertebrates*. New York State Education Department, Albany, New York.
- Funk, D.J. 1998. Isolating a role for natural selection in speciation: host adaptation and sexual isolation in *Neochlamisus bebbianae* leaf beetles. *Evolution* 52: 1744-1759.
- Grant, P.R., B.R. Grant, & J.C. Deutsch. 1996. Speciation and hybridization in island birds. *Philosophical Transaction of the Royal Society: Biological Sciences* 351: 765-772.
- Irwin, D.E., S. Bensch, & T.D. Price. 2001. Speciation in a ring. Nature 409: 333-337.
- Kirkpatrick, M. & Barton, N.H. 1997. The strength of indirect selection on female mating preferences. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 94: 1282–1286.
- Kirschel, A.N., Blumstein, D.T., & Smith, T.B. 2009. Character displacement of song and morphology in African tinkerbirds. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, *106*: 8256-8261.
- Knowlton, N., & Weigt, L.E. 1998. New dates and new rates of divergence across the Isthmus of Panama. *Proc. R. Soc. Lond: B* 265: 2257-2263.
- Lomolino, M.V., B.R. Riddle, R.J. Whittaker, & J.A. Brown. 2010. *Biogeography* (4th ed.). Sinauer Associates, Inc., Sunderland, Mass.

Speciation

References for this section:

- Losos, J.B., & C.E. Parent. 2010. The speciation-area relationship. In The Theory of Island Biogeography
- Revisited, ed. J.B. Losos & R.E. Ricklefs, 415-438. Princeton University Press, Princeton and Oxford.
- Losos, J.B., & R.E. Ricklefs. 2009. Adaptation and diversification on islands. *Nature* 457: 830-836.
- Losos, J.B., & D. Schluter. 2000. Analysis of an evolutionary species-area relationship. *Nature* 408: 847-850. Mallet, J. 2007. Hybrid speciation. *Nature* 446: 279-283.
- Mayr, E. 1963. Animal species and evolution. The Belknap Press, Harvard University.
- McKitrick, M.C. & Zink, R.M. 1988. Species concepts in ornithology. Condor 90: 1-14.
- Otto, S.P., & J. Whitton. 2000. Polyploid incidence and evolution. Ann. Rev. Genet. 34: 401-437.
- Petren, K., P.R. Grant, B.R. Grant, & L.F. Keller. 2005. Comparative landscape genetics and the adaptive radiation of Darwin's finches: the role of peripheral isolation. *Molecular Ecology* 14: 2943–2957.
- Presgraves, D.C. 2010. The molecular evolutionary basis of species formation. *Nature Reviews Genetics* 11: 175-180.
- Sætre, G. P., Moum, T., Bures, S. Král, M., Adamjan, M., & Moreno, J. 1997. A sexually selected character displacement in flycatchers reinforces premating isolation. *Nature* 387: 589-592.
- Sætre, G.P. & Saether, S.A. 2010. Ecology and genetics of speciation in Ficedula flycatchers. *Molecular Ecology* 19: 1091-1106.
- Schliewen, U.K., D. Tautz, & Paabo, S. 1994. Sympatric speciation suggested by monophyly of crater lake cichlids. *Nature* 368: 629-632.
- Schwarz, D., *et al.* 2005. Host shift to an invasive plant triggers rapid animal hybrid speciation. *Nature* 436: 456-549.
- Sorenson, M.D., Sefc, K.M. & Payne, R.B. 2003. Speciation by host switch in brood parasitic indigobirds. *Nature* 424: 928-931.
- Terai, Y., et al. 2006. Divergent selection on opsins drives incipient speciation in Lake Victoria cichlids. *PLoS Biology* 4(12): e433.